The Smithfield Board of Historic and Architectural Review held its regular meeting on Tuesday, February 19th, 2019. The meeting was called to order at 6:30 p.m. Members present were Mr. Trey Gwaltney, Chairman; Mr. Chris Torre, Vice Chairman; Mr. Gary Hess, Ms. Julia Hillegass, Mr. Russell Hill, and Mr. David Goodrich. Mr. Ronny Prevatte was absent. The staff members present Mr. John Settle, Planning and Zoning Administrator; and Mr. William H. Riddick III, Town Attorney. There was one citizen present. The media was not represented.

Chairman Gwaltney – I would like to welcome everyone to the February meeting of the Board of Historic and Architectural Review. The first item on our agenda is the Planning and Zoning Administrator’s Report.

Planning and Zoning Administrator – Thank you, Mr. Chairman. There are three items on the Planning and Zoning Administrator’s Report tonight. There is a picture of the East Main Street dumpster enclosure in the packet. Staff was alerted to the fact last month that the dumpster enclosure appearance changed yet again on East Main Street. Staff has been informed tonight by at least one member of this board that the enclosure has been painted back again to a cream color. Staff will investigate further. Also Town staff did authorize Mr. Joseph McCain of 338 Main Street to utilize “summit gray” paint on the verge boards, soffits, fascia boards, and front porch of his building, and “march wind” paint on the siding. Basically, he is switching two colors that were approved at a prior BHAR meeting. There is also an attachment in the packet explaining that change. Lastly, Ms. Aubrey Von Lindern of the Virginia Department of Historic Resources is planning to be present at the April BHAR meeting as part of the Town’s annual Certified Local Government (CLG) evaluation.

Chairman Gwaltney – Next on the agenda is the Upcoming Meetings and Activities. The list is provided for you to review. The next item on the agenda is Public Comments. We have no one signed up for public comments. Next is Board Member Comments.

Mr. Hess – Has anyone from the Town of Smithfield discussed with Mr. Lee Duncan what he is trying to do with his artistic approach to the dumpster enclosure?

Planning and Zoning Administrator – Yes, sir. We have had conversations with Mr. Duncan. He indicated to us that with changing the appearance of the enclosure he was using the enclosure as a means of expressing the seasons. At least that was the
most recent conversation that we had with Mr. Duncan. I believe the word that he used was "canvas."

Chairman Gwaltney – I think I heard something similar to that.

Mr. Hess – I can hardly wait for Halloween.

Chairman Gwaltney – Are there any other actions on behalf of the town in this situation?

Town Attorney – The Town Manager has sent him a letter at the direction of Town Council telling him to comply with the original design that he proposed and was approved by both the BHAR and Town Council. He has been given a deadline to do so. The consequences are if he doesn’t then he will lose the agreement with the town and he would have to remove everything.

Chairman Gwaltney – What kind of agreement?

Town Attorney – He has a license agreement with the town to locate his dumpster on town property. This took lots of time and effort for him to procure. The town was very generous in its terms.

Ms. Hillegass – He is supposed to take it back to a “dog eared” fence all around and paint it white?

Town Attorney – Yes.

Ms. Hillegass – What is the deadline?

Town Attorney – I don’t know but there was a deadline. It is supposed to be white but I am not sure about the pieces on the edge and the cap around the top. He is supposed to put it back like he originally said he would.

Mr. Hess – He has a hard time taking yes for an answer.

Town Attorney – That is a good way to sum it up, Mr. Hess.

Ms. Hillegass – Is the deadline before or after St. Patrick’s Day?

Town Attorney – I don’t remember when the deadline was. It was entirely reasonable. There are consequences for not doing what you say you are going to do.

Ms. Hillegass – You are absolutely right.

Town Attorney – It was a figurative thumb to the eye.

Chairman Gwaltney – Next on the agenda is Assorted Exterior Changes – 121 south Church Street – Landmark – Timothy and Katherine Mitchem, applicants. Can we have a staff report?
Planning and Zoning Administrator – Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Just to clarify there are assorted exterior changes. The applicants are seeking after-the-fact approval for the expansion of a four foot by eight foot section of the existing, wooden porch to the rear of the house, effectively squaring off the porch into a twelve foot by twenty-two foot porch. The porch is supported by brick piers interspersed with lattice underpinning, identical to that of the rest of the porch. Staff will note that this work was reportedly completed prior to the current ownership of the property. The applicants are also seeking approval to construct a twelve foot by twenty-two foot section of roof over the existing, rear porch. The roof will be a hipped roof of three planes, and covered in a silver-colored, standing seam, metal roof. The roof will be supported by treated, six inch square timbers, painted white in color, which will be joined together by screening and composite, polyvinyl chloride (PVC) panels of a like color. The soffit, fascia, and all remaining trim will be white PVC. The style of the existing, overhang will be emulated in the construction of this new roof. However, the elaborate brackets, which are not original to this building, will not be retained. Lastly, the applicants would like to paint the front door and rear door either royal blue or navy blue. They intend to add Larson storm doors to both doors, which will be a like color. The applicants have provided us with a paint swatch.

Chairman Gwaltney – Is there anyone here to speak on this application?

Mr. Russell Hill – I live at 103 Quillen Point Lane. Mr. Settle summed it up pretty well. Mr. Dave Hare owned the house originally. These people are from West Virginia. They retired and moved here a week before Christmas. They have owned the house for several years. We painted the exterior of the house four months ago. The kitchen was remodeled. They lived in a house that had a garage. Now they are living in a house with no garage or storage. They are looking to use this as a porch. He has all kinds of grills and a pizza oven sitting out in the weather. All the columns and everything on the exterior will be a PVC composite material with a matching color which is an off-white. The panels you see on the drawing are a raised panel. They have dogs so that is the reason he wanted a solid panel on the bottom on the outside.

Chairman Gwaltney – Are the four large open panels above the solid panels going to be screened?

Mr. Hill – Yes, sir.

Chairman Gwaltney – Is the rear door on the porch?
Chairman Gwaltney – Is that a glass door?

Mr. Hill – Yes.

Chairman Gwaltney – Is it a solid storm door on a screened in porch?

Mr. Hill – Yes. It is Larson storm door with three quarter glass in it. We wanted a solid door not just a screen door. It will have the same effect on the bottom of the panel so the dogs will not tear a hole in the screen. If I can make it work it will be a glass transom above it.

Chairman Gwaltney – How much of the door and glass will they be retaining under the new porch roof?

Mr. Hill – All of it.

Chairman Gwaltney – Are they removing the awning?

Mr. Hill – We are taking the exact same awning and tripling the size of it. The characteristics of the back awning will be followed as much as possible.

Chairman Gwaltney – What color is the metal roof on the back of the house?

Mr. Hill – It is copper. The only reason we didn’t go with copper on the front because it was so expensive.

Chairman Gwaltney – Are you going to paint it silver?

Mr. Hill – It comes silver. It is the same product that is at Windsor Castle.

Chairman Gwaltney – Is the color of the new roof going to be the same color as the other metal roof on the house?

Mr. Hill – There is no other metal roof on the house. It is metal. I think that is a copper roof as well. It might be painted.

Chairman Gwaltney – I think it is painted but I am not sure either. I would question why the metal roof on the back of the house would be silver and the shingles are brown, other roof elements are brown, and the metal roof on the front is brown.

Mr. Hill – I cannot answer that. I don’t know if this product can be painted. It comes with a galvanized look, I am not sure whether or not it is painted.

Town Attorney – Is it barn tin?

Mr. Hill – No. It is a standing seam roof.

Chairman Gwaltney – Is it a snap seam?
Mr. Hill – It works the same way. On Bill Riddick’s garage is a standing seam roof but it is hand bent. The only difference is this is ridge bent. The only thing that you will see will be the ridge bent on the valleys. It looks just like a standing seam roof.

Chairman Gwaltney – I had some put on the back of my house several years ago. It came in twenty different colors.

Mr. Hill – I don’t know if this company makes different colors. If you are standing in the driveway you will not be able to see it.

Chairman Gwaltney – If you are on a boat you will see it. The view of the houses from the water is as important as the view from the street.

Mr. Hill – If it is possible to change the color I don’t have a problem with that. I can put a regular standing seam roof that is handmade and paint it.

Chairman Gwaltney – The silver color will not match anything else on the house.

Mr. Hill – We will match the rear porch roof with the color on the front porch roof.

Chairman Gwaltney – I will be happy if you consider that option.

Ms. Hillegass – I think that is a grand idea. I would like to make a motion to approve the application as presented under the condition that the new rear porch roof matches the color of the front porch roof.

Vice Chair Torre – Second.

Chairman Gwaltney – A motion has been made and properly seconded to approve as presented under the condition that the new rear porch roof matches the color of the front porch roof. All those in favor signify by saying aye, all opposed say nay.

On call for the vote, seven members were present. Chairman Gwaltney voted aye, Vice Chair Torre voted aye, Mr. Goodrich voted aye, Mr. Hess voted aye, Mr. Hill abstained, and Ms. Hillegass voted aye. There was one abstention. There were no votes against the motion. The motion passed.

Chairman Gwaltney – Next on the agenda is Approval of the January 15th, 2019 Meeting Minutes.

Town Attorney – Mr. Chairman and members of the board I have reviewed the minutes and made one minor correction. I would recommend the minutes be approved as corrected.

Ms. Hillegass – So moved.

Mr. Hess – Second.
Chairman Gwaltney – A motion has been made and properly seconded to approve the minutes as corrected. All those in favor signify by saying aye, all opposed say nay.

On call for the vote, seven members were present. Chairman Gwaltney voted aye, Vice Chair Torre voted aye, Mr. Goodrich voted aye, Mr. Hess voted aye, Mr. Hill voted aye, and Ms. Hillegass voted aye. There were no votes against the motion. The motion passed.

Chairman Gwaltney – Our meeting is adjourned.

The meeting adjourned at 7:02 p.m.

Mr. Trey Gwaltney  Mr. John Settle  
Chairman  Planning & Zoning Administrator